



City of Del Mar Memorandum

TO: Carey Batha, CCC LCP Grants Coordinator

FROM: Joseph Smith, AICP, Senior Planner

DATE: January 29, 2016

RE: Task 2.3 – STAC/Community Meeting Report through December 2015
LCP-14-13 A/2

Ms. Batha, the following is a summary of meetings completed to-date for our Sea-Level Rise Stakeholder-Technical Advisory Committee (STAC).

Background

STAC was formed by the Del Mar City Council on March 2, 2015. The Committee includes nine members and is charged with assisting City staff and a technical consultant, Environmental Science Associates (ESA), to oversee the preparation of the LCPA to address sea-level rise, storm-surge, and coastal flooding impacts to several vulnerable areas of the City. Specifically, STAC provides oversight and ensures that the amendment process is open, inclusive, and develops consensus amongst the many stakeholders involved. In addition, STAC assists in the review of technical studies and sea-level rise, storm-surge, and coastal flooding planning scenarios; assists the community in prioritizing vulnerable coastal resources; and provides input and policy recommendations to the City Council.

Meetings completed through December 2015

STAC has completed five community meetings to-date. Meeting minutes are attached. *Please note that the minutes from December 3, 2015 meeting are not included as they are still in DRAFT form and have not been approved by the Committee – expected at their February 25, 2016 meeting.*

1. **July 23, 2015** STAC's first meeting; included an overview of the LCP grant work program; selection of chair/vice-chair; input on the creation of a Public Outreach Program (Task 1.4); updates on regional sea-level rise efforts and grants
2. **September 24, 2015** presentation from San Diego Climate Collaborative on their recent grant request to NOAA (which the City supported) and other related work in the region; reviewed the draft Public Outreach Program (Task 1.4); updated the committee work program progress for Gaps Analysis (Task 2.1) and Define Planning Area (Task 2.2); discussion of speakers at upcoming STAC meetings; prepped for a January 2016 community forum event on sea-level rise
3. **October 15, 2015** presentation from City Community Services Department on historical erosion and shoreline trends observed in Del Mar; presentation from Dr. Chet Koblinsky on national and international issues related to sea-level rise; updated the committee on work program progress

for the final Public Outreach Plan (Task 1.4), draft Gaps Analysis (Task 2.1), and draft Planning Area (Task 2.2); prepped for January 2016 community forum

4. **November 5, 2015** updated the committee on work program progress for the final Gaps Analysis (Task 2.1) and draft Planning Area (Task 2.2); prepped for January 2016 community forum
5. **December 3, 2015** presentation from North County Transit District (NCTD) to provide an overview of NCTD's railroad right-of-way through Del Mar as it relates to bluff erosion, storm-surge and sea-level rise, consideration for the long-term use of the right-of-way, and the regulatory context for railroad operations; updated the committee on CoSMoS 3.0 results; discussion on approaches for defining hazards and the Planning Area based on initial CoSMoS 3.0 results; final preparation for the January 2016 community forum; selected 2016 meeting dates

Upcoming STAC meetings are scheduled as followed

6. **January 14, 2016** from 6-8pm, Community Forum on Sea-Level Rise, Powerhouse Community Center, 1658 Coast Blvd, Del Mar [COMPLETED]
7. **February 25, 2016** from 4-6pm, City Hall Annex, 235 11th St, Community Workshop and STAC meeting to discuss the preparation of Vulnerability & Risk Assessments
8. **April 14, 2016** from 4-6pm, City Hall Annex, 235 11th St, STAC meeting to discuss the final Vulnerability & Risk Assessments and feedback on Adaptation approaches
9. **May 5, 2016** from 4-6pm, City Hall Annex, 235 11th St, Community Workshop and STAC meeting to discuss the preparation of an Adaptation Plan
10. **June 9, 2016** from 4-6pm, City Hall Annex, 235 11th St, STAC meeting to discuss the Adaptation Plan
11. **July 21, 2016** from 4-6pm, Del Mar Library, 1309 Camino del Mar, STAC meeting to discuss the final Adaptation Plan
12. **September 29, 2016** from 4-6pm, location Del Mar Library, 1309 Camino del Mar, final STAC meeting to formalize the committee's recommendations to the City Council for amendments to the LCP, Community Plan and Municipal Code related to sea-level rise, coastal-flooding and storm-surge

APPROVED ACTION MINUTES



SEA-LEVEL RISE STAKEHOLDER-TECHNICAL ADVISORY COMMITTEE CITY OF DEL MAR

DEL MAR PUBLIC LIBRARY – 1309 CAMINO DEL MAR
CONFERENCE ROOM
THURSDAY, JULY 23, 2015 – 3:00 PM
City Council Liaisons: Don Mosier, Dwight Worden

COMMITTEE'S STATEMENT OF MISSION/PURPOSE:

Oversee the Sea-Level Rise Local Coastal Program Amendment process to make sure that the process is open, inclusive and develops consensus amongst the many stakeholders; to assist City staff and the consultant with the sea-level rise planning process; to assist in the review of technical studies and sea-level rise planning scenarios; to assist the community in prioritizing vulnerable coastal resources; to discuss and provide advice and policy recommendations to the Del Mar City Council; and to provide input to the Del Mar City Council on the Local Coastal Program Amendment process. (Ref. City Council Resolution 2015-10)

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Anyone may address the Committee for three minutes on any items listed on the agenda. If there are several speakers on an item, your time available to speak may be limited to two minutes. When the Committee Chairperson recognizes you, please step forward and state your name and address of residence clearly for the record. The Committee may ask questions of you, to which you may respond.

For items not on the agenda, please see: *Oral Communications*.

***Note on Action Minutes:** Committee action minutes and public comment received are shown in Times New Roman font and italics under each agenda item.*

- 1. CALL TO ORDER (3:00pm)**
- 2. ROLL CALL AND COMMITTEE INTRODUCTIONS**

All members present. Council member Mosier absent. Committee members introduced themselves and gave a brief statement regarding their interest in serving on the Committee. The following members of the public introduced themselves: Dave Grubb, Sierra Club; Carrie Metzger, graduate student; and Nermin Nergis, Greenpole Research. Staff members present included: Joseph Smith, Planning; Kathy Garcia, Planning; and Jon Edelbrock, Community Services.

- 3. CITY COUNCIL LIAISON WELCOME AND REVIEW OF THE COMMITTEE'S MISSION/PURPOSE AND WORK PROGRAM**

Council member Worden gave a statement on the City Council's intent in establishing the Committee and reviewed the Committee's mission and work program to occur through the end of 2016.

4. INTRODUCTION AND PRESENTATION BY CITY CONSULTANT

Nick Garrity of Environmental Science Associates (ESA) provided an introduction of the firm, relevant projects completed and in progress through the state, and an overview of the Del Mar work program to be completed over the next two years.

5. ORAL COMMUNICATIONS (NON-ACTION ITEM)

State law precludes the Committee from acting on any topic which is not an action item on the posted agenda. Your information may be received, placed on the next agenda, or referred to the Committee Chairperson.

No comments received from the public. General discussion by the Committee on the following: 1) sea-level rise and an overview of the 2012 NRC (National Resource Council) report; 2) sea-level rise guidance document produced by the California Coastal Commission; and 3) sharing relevant information related to sea-level rise on the City's website.

6. TRAINING ON PUBLIC MEETING LAW (BROWN ACT REQUIREMENTS)

Council member Worden and Joseph Smith, Planning provided an overview of the Brown Act and related conflict-of-interest and due-process rules that apply to the Committee's work and to Committee members' actions. There was special emphasis on avoiding serial meetings. Committee members were reminded to turn in their Statement of Economic Interest (700) forms to the Deputy City Clerk.

7. NOMINATIONS FOR AND SELECTION OF A CHAIR, VICE-CHAIR AND SECRETARY

By unanimous vote, Committee member Gaasterland was selected as Chair (motion by Committee member Fletcher, second by Committee member Crabtree), Committee member Bekkar was selected as Vice Chair (motion by Committee member Crabtree, second by Committee member Gaasterland); and Committee member Handzel was selected as Secretary (motion by Committee member Crabtree, second by Committee member Bekkar).

8. DISCUSSION ITEMS:

a. Setting a meeting schedule (either by Task per the Work Program or as a monthly set meeting).

Committee member Crabtree recommended scheduling more frequent meetings during the early part of the work program, and then to distribute out the meeting by task later in the process. General committee discussion on timing and location of future meetings. Vice Chair Bekkar recommended the next meeting be set for September 24, 2015 at 4 pm. Chair Gaasterland recommended adding additional meetings in October, November, and December, with the October meeting to be related to training and informational in nature, and the December meeting to discuss the meeting schedule and work goals for 2016.

A motion was made by Committee member Crabtree and a second by Committee member Brinner that the Committee hold the following meetings through the end of 2015:

Thursday, September 24: 4 to 5:30pm

*Thursday, October 15: ~~4 to 5:30pm~~**

Thursday, November 5: 4 to 5:30pm

Thursday, December 3: 4 to 5:30pm

Additional discussion was provided during the motion as follows: 1) October 15 and December 3 meetings will mostly be training and informational in nature and speakers will be sought to present to the Committee; and 2) December 3 meeting will include a discussion of goals, action items, and a meeting schedule for 2016.

The 2015 meeting schedule and additional items noted above were approved by unanimous vote.

**Staff notes: following the September meeting, staff confirmed that the October 15th meeting will need to be scheduled from 3:30 to 5 pm due to conflicts with the meeting space. In addition, the four meetings will NOT be meeting at the Del Mar Library due to room conflicts and instead, will be held in the City Hall Annex building at 235 11th Street (white trailers directly west of City Hall).*

b. Input on the creation of a public outreach program, including stakeholders and methods for community input.

Council member Crabtree recommended that the Public Outreach Program (to be prepared) should first target Del Mar residents and businesses. Committee discussion, including suggestions by Chair Gaasterland and Vice Chair Bekkar about holding a community forum at Powerhouse Park for residents and businesses to learn about the Committee's work program, hear presentations on sea-level rise and implications from its anticipated effects to the City, and obtain feedback from the community. Committee member Giddings suggested the forum should be held in the evening in the first two weeks of January. Additional Committee discussion to advertise the forum: 1) at the City's upcoming Sustainability Fair on September 24, 2015; 2) as part of the outreach for the Committee's December 3, 2015 meeting; 3) on the City's website and calendar; and 4) by sending STAC representatives to other City committees and events.

By consensus, the Committee will plan to hold an evening community forum during the first two weeks of January 2016, possibly either Thursday, January 7th or Thursday, January 14th with the goal of hosting the forum at Powerhouse Park.

c. Consideration to re-name the Committee (STAC).

By consensus, the Committee will keep the name Sea-Level Rise Stakeholder-Technical Advisory Committee (STAC).

9. UPDATES ON REGIONAL SEA-LEVEL RISE EFFORTS AND GRANTS

Joseph Smith, Planning provided an overview of other planning efforts being conducted in surrounding jurisdictions and the status of grants from the San Diego Foundation and National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration (NOAA).

10. ITEMS FOR NEXT AGENDA

The following items were discussed as part of future agenda:

- 1. Continued discussion on the work program and upcoming tasks. [ongoing]*
- 2. Committee review and action on a Public Outreach Program under preparation by Katz & Associates. [anticipated for the September 24, 2015 meeting]*
- 3. Presentation from representative(s) from the North County Transit District (NCTD) and/or Santa Fe railroad to discuss their use of the NCTD right-of-way through Del Mar, considerations for future use of the right-of-way and alternatives, and an understanding of Santa Fe's rights on NCTD's right-of-way. [staff to invite; schedule when available]*
- 4. Presentation from Patrick Barnard, Research Geologist with USGS and Timu Gallien from Scripps Institute of Oceanography (and other speakers noted by the Committee, including Committee members as well) to give a presentation on sea-level rise and related impacts, topical items, and sea-level rise projections and ranges (including a review of the data ranges provided in the 2012 NRC report). [Committee and/or staff to invite; preference for the October 15, 2015 meeting]*
- 5. Continue to plan for the January 2016 community forum. [ongoing item]*
- 6. Discussion of goals and action items related to the work program, and set a meeting schedule for 2016. [December 3, 2015 meeting]*
- 7. General updates related to the work program from Committee members, staff, and ESA, such as information, articles and studies of interest, and events attended and upcoming. [ongoing]*

11. ADJOURNMENT (5:00pm)

Next meeting to be held at 4:00 p.m., Thursday, September 24, 2015 at the City Hall Annex, 235 11th Street.



**APPROVED MINUTES
SEA-LEVEL RISE STAKEHOLDER-TECHNICAL
ADVISORY COMMITTEE (STAC)
CITY OF DEL MAR**

**DEL MAR CITY HALL ANNEX
235 11th STREET, DEL MAR 92014
THURSDAY, SEPTEMBER 24, 2015 – 4:00 PM
City Council Liaisons: Don Mosier, Dwight Worden**

COMMITTEE'S STATEMENT OF MISSION/PURPOSE:

Oversee the Sea-Level Rise Local Coastal Program Amendment process to make sure that the process is open, inclusive and develops consensus amongst the many stakeholders; to assist City staff and the consultant with the sea-level rise planning process; to assist in the review of technical studies and sea-level rise planning scenarios; to assist the community in prioritizing vulnerable coastal resources; to discuss and provide advice and policy recommendations to the Del Mar City Council; and to provide input to the Del Mar City Council on the Local Coastal Program Amendment process. (Ref. City Council Resolution 2015-10)

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Anyone may address the Committee for three minutes on any items listed on the agenda. If there are several speakers on an item, your time available to speak may be limited to two minutes. When the Committee Chairperson recognizes you, please step forward and state your name and address of residence clearly for the record. The Committee may ask questions of you, to which you may respond.

For items not on the agenda, please see: *Oral Communications*.

1. CALL TO ORDER (4:00pm)

2. ROLL CALL

All members present except Sarah Giddings. Council member Mosier and Worden were also present. Joseph Smith, Planning, and Jon Edelbrock, Community Services were present. Public attendees included Dave Grubb, Sierra Club and Laura Engeman, San Diego Climate Collaborative. Laura gave a brief overview of the SD Collaborative and Council member Mosier introduced himself.

3. APPROVAL OF MINUTES (July 23, 2015 meeting)

Handzel motioned for approval, Gasterland seconded. July 23rd Minutes were approved without changes.

4. CITY COUNCIL LIAISON COMMENTS

Worden and Mosier discussed several articles about sea-level rise. Mosier said in the past, only five of 11 El Nino's have produced higher than average rainfalls and since most El Nino's only impact Santa Barbara and to the south, a coming El Nino would not impact the Sierra snowpack. Mosier provided an overview of the Scripps Institute of Oceanography King Tides event on September 9.

5. COMMITTEE MEMBER AND STAFF UPDATES

Bekkar discussed how one-foot of sea-level rise equates to 100' of coastal runup impacts. Gaasterland discussed SIO's monitoring of ocean temperature at the top and bottom of their pier. Additional committee discussion on current water temperatures setting new records and tides being one-half above predicted heights. Staff requested a presentation from NCTD representative Johnny Dunning; to-date he has not responded to the request. City Sustainability Resource Fair was being held after the STAC meeting. Oct 12th Volunteer appreciation night was discussed.

STAC website is under construction and web address is www.delmar.ca.us/sealevelrise. A general email to share with the public for those interested in receiving future updates or for questions on the work program is coastalplanning@delmar.ca.us (sends an email to Joseph Smith, Planning). Nick Garrity of Environmental Science Associates (ESA) shared a website that monitors La Jolla Tides – NOAA's Tides and Currents (tidesandcurrents.noaa.gov). Bekkar shared a website blog on the El Nino discussion (weatherwest.com). Brinner shared a movie (Shored Up) that provides an overview of beach engineering and structures. Buhr discussed an upcoming training titled "Climate-Smart Conversation" being held by the resource agencies and local partners on November 6 (all day) at the San Diego Foundation.

6. ORAL COMMUNICATIONS (NON-ACTION ITEMS)

Dave Grubb discussed Sierra Club's interest in attending ongoing STAC meetings.

<p>State law precludes the Committee from acting on any topic which is not an action item on the posted agenda. Your information may be received, placed on the next agenda, or referred to the Committee Chairperson.</p>
--

7. PRESENTATION FROM COMMITTEE MEMBER SARAH GIDDINGS ON SEA-LEVEL RISE AND EXTREME STORMS

This presentation was postponed to the October 15th meeting when Sarah Giddings could attend.

8. PRESENTATION BY LAURA ENGEMAN, EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR OF THE SAN DIEGO CLIMATE COLLABORATIVE, ON THEIR RECENT GRANT REQUEST TO NOAA AND OTHER RELATED WORK IN THE REGION

Laura Engeman gave a presentation on the work the SD Climate Collaborative is doing in the San Diego region (sdclimatecollaborative.org). She provided a list of the organizations they are working with along with a discussion of outstanding grants that are in progress. Laura invited the Committee to attend their future Climate Collaborative meetings and discussed an upcoming workshop they are facilitating on November 18 from 9:30am to noon at the City of San Diego Library (tentative). The workshop will be geared around the latest USGS sea-level rise models and how to use the tools. Laura noted that the LCP amendment being prepared by the City of Goleta is a similar work program that Del Mar is undergoing.

9. REVIEW AND COMPLETE WORK PROGRAM TASK 1.4 – PUBLIC OUTREACH PLAN PREPARED BY KATZ & ASSOCIATES

Nick Garrity, ESA provided an update on the draft Public Outreach Plan. The Committee provided the following revisions prior to the document being made final.

- i. *Add the following:*
 1. *Business Support Advisory Committee (City advisory committee)*
 2. *Del Mar Village Association (non-profit)*
 3. *Resource agencies:*
 - a. *California State Parks*
 - b. *US Fish & Wildlife*
 - c. *Army Corps of Engineers*
 - d. *Regional Water Quality Control Board*
 4. *Coastal Community Foundation (non-profit)*
 5. *Del Mar Thoroughbred Club*
 6. *California Department of Transportation*
 7. *California State Lands Commission*
 8. *Del Mar Lifeguards (Community Services Department)*
 9. *Note: Del Mar Foundation is a non-profit*
- ii. *Develop a social networking presence – Facebook (create page), Twitter*
- iii. *Advertise to ‘visitors’ in addition to residents and businesses*
- iv. *Add “written notices” to Step 4 (in addition to emails)*
- v. *Coordinate STAC workshops and events with others that are planned in the City*
- vi. *Utilize the Del Mar Library and Del Mar Community Connections for readings and topical information related to the work program*
- vii. *Avoid the use of a survey that does not have statistical meaning. If there is interest in using a survey, it needs to be statistically-balanced and include all residents, not just those in potentially vulnerable areas*
- viii. *STAC workshop 1 in Spring 2016 and workshop 2 in Fall 2016*

10. UPDATE FROM ESA AND STAFF ON WORK PROGRAM PROGRESS AND REVIEW UPCOMING TASKS WITH COMMITTEE FEEDBACK:

Task 2.1 – Compile Data and Existing Analyses, Determine Data and Informational Gaps

Continued to the November 5, 2015 meeting

1. Task 2.2 – Define the Planning Area

Continued to the November 5, 2015 meeting. Note: need to get addresses of all people to be notified once the ordinances are developed.

11. DISCUSSION ITEMS:

1. Speakers to present at upcoming STAC meetings

No firm commitment yet for future speakers

2. STAC community forum in January 2016, including consideration for a subcommittee to assist in event planning, program, and outreach; confirmation of a day and time; and related actions (note: Powerhouse is available for January 14, 2016)

January 14, 2016 has been reserved for the Committee's Community Forum. Powerhouse has been reserved in the evening.

12. ITEMS FOR NEXT AGENDA

Remaining items provided at the July 23, 2015 meeting

13. ADJOURNMENT (5:30pm)

Brinner motioned, Gaasterland seconded. Next meeting to be held at 3:30 – 5:00 p.m., October 15, 2015 at the City Hall Annex, 235 11th Street.

Note: Following the meeting, Committee members are invited to attend and represent STAC at the City's Sustainability Resource Fair and Climate Action Plan Open House. The event will be located at Powerhouse Park from 6 to 8pm. An informational booth will be available for STAC.



**APPROVED MINUTES
SEA-LEVEL RISE STAKEHOLDER-TECHNICAL
ADVISORY COMMITTEE (STAC)
CITY OF DEL MAR**

**DEL MAR CITY HALL ANNEX
235 11th STREET, DEL MAR 92014
THURSDAY, OCTOBER 15, 2015 – 3:30 PM
City Council Liaisons: Don Mosier, Dwight Worden**

COMMITTEE'S STATEMENT OF MISSION/PURPOSE:

Oversee the Sea-Level Rise Local Coastal Program Amendment process to make sure that the process is open, inclusive and develops consensus amongst the many stakeholders; to assist City staff and the consultant with the sea-level rise planning process; to assist in the review of technical studies and sea-level rise planning scenarios; to assist the community in prioritizing vulnerable coastal resources; to discuss and provide advice and policy recommendations to the Del Mar City Council; and to provide input to the Del Mar City Council on the Local Coastal Program Amendment process. (Ref. City Council Resolution 2015-10)

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Anyone may address the Committee for three minutes on any items listed on the agenda. If there are several speakers on an item, your time available to speak may be limited to two minutes. When the Committee Chairperson recognizes you, please step forward and state your name and address of residence clearly for the record. The Committee may ask questions of you, to which you may respond.

For items not on the agenda, please see: *Oral Communications*.

1. CALL TO ORDER (3:30pm)

2. ROLL CALL

All members were present except Bruce Bekkar and Sarah Giddings. Council members Don Mosier and Dwight Worden were present. Joseph Smith from the Planning Department and Eric Sandy and Mark Rathsam from Community Services were present. Nick Garrity of ESA was not present.

3. APPROVAL OF MINUTES (September 24, 2015 meeting)

Handzel motioned for approval, Brinner seconded. September 24, 2015 meeting minutes were approved without changes.

4. CITY COUNCIL LIAISON COMMENTS

Worden commented that City Council is very interested in the activities of the Committee. Mosier provided an update and discussed some issues with the improvements being made by NCTD to the railroad trestle bridge over San Dieguito River, including construction conflicts with increases in high tides and construction timing to take three times longer than expected. He also discussed that lagoon dredging will occur by SCE at the end of the year. He noted that the proposed replacement railroad bridge is going to be eight feet higher in elevation than the original to accommodate future sea rise.

5. COMMITTEE MEMBER AND STAFF UPDATES

Brinner discussed a paper she will send for circulation to the Committee regarding the Pacific Decadal Oscillation (PDO), which is a slowly oscillating pattern of sea surface temperatures in the Pacific Ocean. Handzel submitted some documents on the geology of the Del Mar bluffs and seawalls. Gaasterland noted that she would reach out to colleague Falk Feddersen about a possible presentation to the Committee. Gaasterland requested the status of a presentation to the Committee by an NCTD representative. Smith noted that NCTD has been contacted but a presentation date is still pending. Smith also gave an update on the STAC website (www.delmar.ca.us/sealevelrise) and confirmed that all documents and articles circulated to the Committee would be made available on the website.

6. ORAL COMMUNICATIONS FROM THE PUBLIC (NON-ACTION ITEMS)

Public members introduced themselves, including a student from UCSD who was interested in the STAC process.

7. STAFF UPDATE ON WORK PROGRAM AND UPCOMING TASKS

Smith provided an update on the Work Program and upcoming tasks. Task 1.4 (Public Outreach Plan) has been completed and provided to the Coastal Commission. Task 2.1 (Gaps Analysis) will be the next item to complete; however the final deliverable date has been adjusted to November 18, 2015 due to delayed CoSMoS results. Garrity will be providing an update on Task 2.1 at the November 5, 2015 meeting and take feedback from the Committee before finalizing this document. Following, Task 2.2 (Defining the Planning Area) will be completed with a final deliverable date of January 29, 2016.

8. COMMITTEE DISCUSSION OF PLANNING FOR THE COMMUNITY FORUM IN JANUARY 2016

The Committee discussed planning for the Community Forum in January. The event is set for Thursday, January 14, 2016 from 6 to 8 p.m. at Powerhouse. The Committee also created a subcommittee to continue discussions on event planning. The subcommittee consists of Brinner, Bekkar (nominated), and Crabtree.

The Committee also discussed the following items:

- 1) Utilize the outdoor area of Powerhouse to have topical stations of interest for each stakeholder group with printed boards and key bullet points (e.g., beach/bluff owners, lagoon restoration, fairgrounds/racetrack, recreational beach users, etc.). Following, have the group go into Powerhouse for presentations and interactive sessions. Obtain as much feedback as possible and utilize audience engagement.*
- 2) Presentation ideas:*
 - a) Find a well-respected and dynamic speaker give a short introduction/presentation on the general issues (no more than 10 to 15 minutes). Names discussed included Falk Feddersen and/or Adam Young, both SIO*
 - b) Include another presentation by Community Services to discuss anecdotal and historical information about changes observed in Del Mar over several decades.*

- c) *Include another presentation by the STAC chair about what the City/Committee is doing and why.*
- 3) *Print several pictures and illustrations demonstrating how sea-level rise and related effects will impact people's interests in Del Mar's coastline and lagoon.*
- 4) *Have potential solutions and adaptation strategies available for early discussion.*
- 5) *Determine what CoSMos material will be available to present at the forum and try to adapt the information to Del Mar specifically.*
- 6) *Try to focus on the "local application" of all information presented and opportunities for feedback.*
- 7) *In addition to beachfront/bluff-top property owners, advertise the forum to the beach-going public (surfers, recreational users), all property owners including non-beachfront/bluff-top, other municipal/government, and other key stakeholders referenced in the Public Outreach Plan.*
- 8) *Create a one-page take home information sheet consisting of the Committee's goals, timeline, and where they can get more information on the Work Program.*
- 9) *Provide food and drinks (Joseph will determine the amount of budget we have to be used for food at the meeting).*
- 10) *Need to determine if lights for the outdoor area will be needed.*

9. PRESENTATION BY MARK RATHSAM AND ERIC SANDY, COMMUNITY SERVICES DEPARTMENT ON THE HISTORICAL EROSION AND SHORELINE TRENDS OBSERVED IN DEL MAR OVER SEVERAL DECADES

Sandy and Rathsam gave a presentation on the observed changes that have occurred during the last several decades years along the City's shoreline, including several historical photos and anecdotal stories. Sandy noted that they would be willing to provide the presentation at the Community Forum in January 2016.

10. PRESENTATION BY DR. CHET KOBLINSKY ON THE NATIONAL AND INTERNATIONAL ISSUES RELATED TO SEA-LEVEL RISE

Dr. Chet Koblinsky gave a presentation on national and international issues related to sea-level rise, including a discussion on data that has been collected and analyzed by NOAA. He noted that the City is currently experiencing mean high tides that are roughly 8 inches above the predicted tables due to ocean warming in the Pacific. He discussed the coming El Nino, related it to the 1982-83 storms, and discussed how this winter's storm season may turn out to be reference point for future sea rise due to these higher than normal high tides. He suggested that the 2012 NRC Report is a great reference point to start from for the City as it moves into planning for sea-level rise adaptation. He presented information on using the NOAA Coastal Viewer web tool (coast.noaa.gov/slr), and recommended the Committee reach out to the insurance industry to understand how they are planning to address these issues in coastal areas.

11. ITEMS FOR NEXT AGENDA

Mosier recommended reaching out to Davia Lynch with NCTD for a presentation to the Committee.

12. ADJOURNMENT (5:00pm)

Handzel motioned, Crabtree seconded.



**APPROVED MINUTES
SEA-LEVEL RISE STAKEHOLDER-TECHNICAL
ADVISORY COMMITTEE (STAC)
CITY OF DEL MAR**

**DEL MAR CITY HALL ANNEX
235 11th STREET, DEL MAR 92014
THURSDAY, NOVEMBER 5, 2015 – 4:00 PM
City Council Liaisons: Don Mosier, Dwight Worden**

COMMITTEE'S STATEMENT OF MISSION/PURPOSE:

Oversee the Sea-Level Rise Local Coastal Program Amendment process to make sure that the process is open, inclusive and develops consensus amongst the many stakeholders; to assist City staff and the consultant with the sea-level rise planning process; to assist in the review of technical studies and sea-level rise planning scenarios; to assist the community in prioritizing vulnerable coastal resources; to discuss and provide advice and policy recommendations to the Del Mar City Council; and to provide input to the Del Mar City Council on the Local Coastal Program Amendment process. (Ref. City Council Resolution 2015-10)

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Anyone may address the Committee for three minutes on any items listed on the agenda. If there are several speakers on an item, your time available to speak may be limited to two minutes. When the Committee Chairperson recognizes you, please step forward and state your name and address of residence clearly for the record. The Committee may ask questions of you, to which you may respond.

For items not on the agenda, please see: *Oral Communications*.

1. CALL TO ORDER (4:00pm)

2. ROLL CALL

All members were present except Kim Fletcher and Sarah Giddings. Council member Don Mosier was present. Council member Dwight Worden was not present. Joseph Smith from the Planning Department and Nick Garrity of ESA were present.

3. APPROVAL OF MINUTES (October 15, 2015 meeting)

Crabtree motioned for approval, Handzel seconded. October 15, 2015 meeting minutes were approved. Bekkar abstained.

4. CITY COUNCIL LIAISON COMMENTS

Mosier commented that the improvements being made by North County Transit District (NCTD) to the railroad trestle bridge over the San Dieguito River were almost complete; that lagoon dredging had started by Southern California Edison (SCE); and NCTD staff is planning to give a presentation to the Committee at their December 3, 2015 meeting.

5. COMMITTEE MEMBER AND STAFF UPDATES

Buhr noted that the California Coastal Commission (CCC) added a page on their website with information on the predicted El Niño and a checklist to assist homeowners prepare for the

anticipated storms (<http://www.coastal.ca.gov/climate/extreme-weather/el-nino/>). Buhr also explained the CCC's ability to issue Emergency Coastal Development Permits (ECDPs) for situations where it is demonstrated that there is an imminent threat to life and/or property. Buhr also noted the following: 1) the CCC is preparing an expedited process for issuing ECDPs; 2) any issued ECDP would be temporary and conditioned to be removed following the threat or permitted subject to a regular CDP; 3) evaluating sea-level rise has become a priority by the CCC in all project reviews; and 4) the CCC webpage on El Nino has application information for homeowners in the event an ECDP is needed from the CCC (link above). Bekkar requested staff add a link to the CCC webpage on the STAC website.

Bekkar requested staff confirm with the Public Works Department if sand bags would be made available to residents during the winter season. Buhr noted that king tides will occur during the Thanksgiving and Christmas holidays. Smith provided an update on the STAC website and confirmed that NCTD will provide a presentation to the Committee at their December 3, 2015 meeting. Bekkar requested staff verify if the City will be making preparations to help prevent erosion of the bluff areas during the predicted El Niño and winter storms.

6. ORAL COMMUNICATIONS FROM THE PUBLIC (NON-ACTION ITEMS)

State law precludes the Committee from acting on any topic which is not an action item on the posted agenda. Your information may be received, placed on the next agenda, or referred to the Committee Chairperson.

Public members introduced themselves, including Chet Koblinsky, Sarah Richmond, Dave Grubb with the Sierra Club, and Dahvia Lynch with NCTD. Grubb noted that one of the leading causes of bluff erosion is heavy rain and recommended a new book that discusses historical bluff erosion titled "Surf, Sand, and Stone: How Waves, Earthquakes, and Other Forces Shape the Southern California Coast." Lynch introduced herself and confirmed that NCTD will be giving a presentation at the Committee's December 3, 2015 meeting.

7. DISCUSSION ON WORK PROGRAM AND UPCOMING TASKS (ESA)

Smith provided an update on the Work Program and upcoming tasks, and noted that the CoSMoS results from USGS have been delayed. As a result, staff is working with the CCC to amend the Committee's milestone dates for the Work Program accordingly. Garrity noted that the preliminary CoSMoS results would be available November 15, 2015 with the final results expected for June 2016. Garrity discussed that CoSMoS would provide estimates of long-term coastal erosion with sea-level rise, extreme storm-event coastal erosion, and extreme coastal flooding.

Garrity provided a summary of Task 2.1 (Gaps Analysis) and discussed the following: 1) flood and erosion hazard analysis; vulnerability and risk assessments; adaptation planning; and the proposed amendment to the City's Local Coastal Program (LCP). Garrity presented the trend in sea-level rise from 1920-2015 and noted that the average rate is 0.08 inches per year (2.11mm/yr), or generally 1 inch every 10 years. Garrity noted that this rate is expected to accelerate. Garrity also summarized information from the Gaps Analysis.

Brinner requested if human causes should be considered in the City's hazards analysis (e.g., damming of rivers and hard coastline structures which result in a loss of sand supply). Garrity confirmed that human causes are a part of the CoSMoS results and will be part of the City's hazards analysis.

Mosier noted that the state's tsunami inundation maps are outdated if the City is considering them as part of the hazards analysis. Bekkar and Gaasterland requested the language used for "20, 50 and 100-year storms" should be revised for relevancy in the City's analysis (e.g., 1% annual chance of occurrence).

Buhr discussed SCE's responsibility, in perpetuity, to maintain the inlet of the San Dieguito River. The Committee requested that the Gaps Analysis include utility information from San Diego Gas and Electric (SDGE) so this can be evaluated as part of the vulnerability assessment.

8. COMMITTEE DISCUSSION OF PLANNING FOR THE COMMUNITY FORUM IN JANUARY 2016

Subcommittee noted that it would meet prior to the Committee's December 3, 2015 meeting and create a short list of tasks for the January Forum. The subcommittee would present the tasks at the December meeting. Crabtree emphasized the need for an education component at the forum. Gaasterland suggested using "one-slide" talks to facilitate discussion.

9. ITEMS FOR NEXT AGENDA

Presentation by NCTD

10. ADJOURNMENT (5:10pm)

Brinner motioned, Crabtree seconded